

Bach Network UK

Seventh Johann Sebastian Bach Dialogue Meeting

Programme
and
Dialogue Topics

8-10 July 2015

Madingley Hall, Cambridge

Sponsors

Bach Network UK

Co-convenors

Matthew Laube (University of Cambridge)

Ruth Tatlow (Musik- och teaterbibliotek, Statens Musikverk, Stockholm)

Yo Tomita (Queen's University Belfast)

Peter Smaill (Edinburgh)

Scientific Committee

Ruth Tatlow (Musik- och teaterbibliotek, Statens Musikverk, Stockholm)

Yo Tomita (Queen's University Belfast)

Stephen Rose (Royal Holloway, University of London)

Szymon Paczkowski (University of Warsaw)

Bettina Varwig (King's College London)

Council members and Trustees of Bach Network UK

John Butt

Richard D. P. Jones

Szymon Paczkowski

Katharine Pardee

Stephen Rose

Peter Smaill (Chair of trustees)

Reinhard Strohm

Ruth Tatlow (Chair of council)

Yo Tomita

Bettina Varwig

Programme at a Glance

WEDNESDAY 8 JULY

- 12 noon** Reception opens. Room check-in from 14.00.
- 14-16.00** Afternoon tea. Registration.
- 16.00** Welcome.
- 16.30-17.30** **Session 1: Global Bach Research**
- Reinhard Strohm – ‘Balzan project and Bach’
 - Tobias Robert Klein – ‘Bach to Africa and Forward towards a global aesthetics of music’
- 17.30-18.15** **Lecture-Recital**
- Chiara Bertoglio – ‘Enhancing the Spectacular: Busoni on Bach’s Goldberg Variations’
- 18.30** Barbeque for all delegates in the grounds of Madingley Hall

THURSDAY 9 JULY

- 7.00-9.00** Breakfast
- Time to explore the grounds, catch up with friends, continue discussions etc.
- 9.30-11.00** **Session 2: Principles of Performance Lost and Gained**
- John Butt on Bach-related subjects in conversation with Yo Tomita, Michael Marissen and Bettina Varwig
- 11.00-11.30** Coffee break
- 11.30-12.45** **Session 3: Young Scholars’ Forum**
- Thomas Cressy – ‘バツハ: Bach and Japan’
 - Kaoru Matsubara – ‘Recognition of Counterpoint by the contemporaries of J. S. Bach’
 - Bradley Brookshire – ‘Edwin Fischer and Bach-Pianism of the Weimar Republic’
 - Maria Borghesi – ‘Italian Instructive Editions of Bach’s Two-Part Inventions, c.1870-1985’

- Andrew Frampton – ‘A Copyist of Bach and Zelenka: Identifying the Scribe of GB-Ob MS Tenbury 749’

12.45–14.00 Lunch

14.00–15.30 **Session 4: Cantatas in Context**

- Bernd Koska – ‘Bach’s Thomaner – Disciples of their Teacher?’
- Christine Blanken – ‘A University Student as Librettist – Important Impetus for Bach’s Church Music in Leipzig’

15.30–16.00 Tea/Coffee break

16.00–17.45 **Session 5: Copyists, Cantatas, Chorales and Censorship**

- Tatiana Shabalina – ‘Activities around the composer’s desk: the roles of Bach and his copyists in parody production’
- Peter Smaill – ‘Prince Albert and the Reception of the Chorale in England’
- Stephen Rose – ‘Creativity versus censorship in the Lutheran church cantata’

Evening meal at own expense

There are inexpensive bar meals at Madingley, with plenty of space to sit with friends and continue conversations, or a more lavish restaurant option in Madingley village.

FRIDAY 10 JULY

7.00–9.00 Breakfast

9.00 Room checkout for those not staying over Friday night. Bags and cases can be safely stored at Reception.

9.15–10.45 **Session 6: Music, Musicians and Patronage in Saxon during the reign of August the Strong**

- Samantha Owens – ‘Music via Correspondence: A List of the Collection of Kreuzkirche Organist Emanuel Benisch’
- Janice B. Stockigt – ‘Organists of Leipzig’s royal Catholic chapel 1719–1740 (and beyond)’
- Szymon Paczkowski – ‘In the shadow of the Hofkapelle: music and musicians in the circle of the Dresden nobility during the reign of August II and August III’

10.45–11.30 Coffee

- 11.30–12.30** **Session 7: Bach’s musical texts**
- Gergely Fazekas – ‘The conflict of symmetrical form and text setting by J. S. Bach’
 - Zoltán Szabó – ‘Critical edition or As You Like It’
- 12.30–14.00** Lunch
- 14.00–14.45** **Session 8: New Online Resources for Bach Scholarship**
- Yo Tomita, Christine Blanken and Christiane Hausmann to present the new development and future plans at Bach-Archiv Leipzig
- 14.45–15.30** **Dialogue Roundup: BNUK in 2015**
- Ruth Tatlow, Bach Network Council and BNUK Trustees in open discussion about the direction of our activities.
- 15.30–16.00** Tea break
- 16.00** Taxis to Cambridge
- Those wishing to take advantage of the Dialogue discounts on books at the Cambridge University Press shop should take the first taxi, as the shop closes at 17.30 on Fridays.
- Evening meal in Cambridge at your own expense**
- 19.30** **Bach Celebration at King’s College Chapel**
Dunedin Consort and John Butt
- c22.00** Taxis return to Madingley. (Timings and instructions orchestrated by Matthew Laube.)

SATURDAY 11 JULY

- 7.30–9.30** Breakfast
- Room check out 9am
- Matthew Laube will also help coordinate shared taxis to Cambridge Station or airports, or any car shares that may be available. Please coordinate your wishes with him.

Dialogue Topics



Welcome

RUTH TATLOW (CHAIR, BACH NETWORK UK COUNCIL)

PETER SMAILL (CHAIR, BACH NETWORK UK TRUSTEES)

MATTHEW LAUBE (DIALOGUE ADMINISTRATOR)



Dialogue Session 1

GLOBAL BACH RESEARCH

Balzan Project and Bach

REINHARD STROHM (UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD)

Bach to Africa and Forward towards a global aesthetics of music

TOBIAS ROBERT KLEIN (HUMBOLDT UNIVERSITY OF BERLIN)

This presentation aims to provide a comprehensive overview of the marginal, selective and yet historically instructively intertwined colonial and (post)colonial reception of Bach's Music on the African continent. The institutional, compositional and intellectual repercussions of this cultural encounter will also be discussed with respect to the embattled question of a possible epistemological and aesthetic surplus that arises from music's global spread and reception.

Lecture-Recital

ENHANCING THE SPECTACULAR: BUSONI ON BACH'S GOLDBERG VARIATIONS

CHIARA BERTOGLIO (UNIVERSITY OF ROME TOR VERGATA)

Exactly a century ago, in 1915, Breitkopf & Härtel issued Ferruccio Busoni's 'concert version' of Bach's *Aria mit verschiedenen Veränderungen* ('Goldberg Variations'), within the so-called *Busoni-Ausgabe* of Bach's keyboard works. The output of Busoni's editorial work is neither a paraphrase/transcription similar to his pianistic renditions of Bach's organ works, nor a mere instructive edition. Rather, by intervening on the formal structure of Bach's original, Busoni created a new, well-proportioned and partially flexible and modifiable artwork out of a well-proportioned artwork, with the aim of enhancing the suitability of Bach's *Goldberg Variations* for public performance.

Questions: This lecture-recital, in which a concert version of the *Goldberg Variations* created in compliance with Busoni's instructions will be performed in its entirety, aims at offering the following questions for debate: Why did Busoni deem his interventions on Bach's original necessary in order to familiarise the audience of his time with this work? Which reasons may we infer for his choice to suppress or to maintain certain variations or certain features of Bach's original? Which role is given to the performer of Busoni's version, and how can this relate with the concept of 'open work'?



Dialogue Session 2

PRINCIPLES OF PERFORMANCE LOST AND GAINED

JOHN BUTT (UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW)

YO TOMITA (QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY BELFAST)

MICHAEL MARISSEN (SWARTHMORE COLLEGE)

BETTINA VARWIG (KING'S COLLEGE LONDON)

John Butt in conversation with Yo Tomita, Michael Marissen and Bettina Varwig on Bach-related subjects: Well-Tempered Clavier, St John Passion and the future of Bach.



Dialogue Session 3

YOUNG SCHOLARS' FORUM

MODERATOR – STEPHEN ROSE (ROYAL HOLLOWAY)

‘バツハ’: Bach and Japan

THOMAS CRESSY (TOKYO UNIVERSITY OF THE ARTS)

In recent decades, Japanese scholars and performers have made a significant contribution to the performance and study of Bach's music. Even now, Bach's music enjoys a continued popularity in Japan, taking a place in Japanese music education and musical activity in general. Indeed, there is now a situation where a Non-Western country is one of the world's biggest consumers of 'Western Classical Music', including the music of Bach; yet, this phenomenon remains almost entirely ignored by non-Japanese musicologists.

Question: What can the example of the reception of Bach in Japan add to Bach scholarship? Perhaps Japan provides a unique case on which concepts such as the 'Universality', 'Religiosity' and 'Modernity' of Bach's music can be further reflected upon—as well as food for thought on the cultural geography and current discourses of 'Western Classical Music' in general?

Recognition of Counterpoint by the contemporaries of J. S. Bach

KAORU MATSUBARA (UNIVERSITY OF TOKYO)

While a mathematical view of music and alchemical thought still survived among some theorists in the eighteenth century, Mattheson in his early writings and Heinichen, among others, criticised music that was restricted by strict contrapuntal rules, such as eye music (*Augenmusik*), arguing that the ear (*sensus*) must predominate over the strict contrapuntal rules (*ratio*). However, because those discourses do not relate to a single music theoretical aspect, the judgement of counterpoint cannot be understood in terms of a simple dichotomy. My current research interest is in the aesthetics of counterpoint, specifically in exploring how to understand counterpoint as it changed throughout the eighteenth century in relation to J. S. Bach and contemporary thought.

Questions: What does the word 'Symphoniurgie' mean in Mattheson's *Der Vollkommene Cappellmeister*? How does it reflect the understanding of counterpoint in the eighteenth century?

Edwin Fischer and Bach-Pianism of the Weimar Republic

BRADLEY BROOKSHIRE (PURCHASE COLLEGE, NEW YORK)

My dissertation analyses principles of Bach-pianism in Edwin Fischer's HMV recording of *The Well-Tempered Clavier* (released serially, 1933–1937) and his *Tonmeister-Ausgabe* editions of Bach's keyboard works for Ullstein Verlag (1926–1930). Fischer deploys a wide range of interpretive nuances aimed purposefully at the amplification of musical structure, linked consistently and without modification. This approach is striking both for its similarity to ideas espoused in Fischer's immediate network (e.g., Hugo Riemann, Heinrich Schenker, and architects of the Bauhaus) and for its durability in the subsequent evolution of Bach-pianism. Taking Fischer's importance as a seminal recording artist, the international scope of his pedagogy, and the wide availability of his Ullstein Bach-editions to account, I suggest that Fischer (partly as an avatar of his mentor, Ferruccio Busoni) established some of the fundamental tenets of Bach-pianism from the post-war era to the present.

Questions: Except for Busoni, can Bach-pianists be found with influence-networks equal to or greater than Fischer's who employed the principle of pianistic Bach-interpretation as non-evolving amplification of musical structure? Without resort to magical thinking (such as *Zeitgeist* theory), do alternate theories better explain similarity between Fischer's approach and later Bach-pianism?

Italian Instructive Editions of Bach's Two-Part Inventions, c.1870–1985

MARIA BORGHESI (UNIVERSITY OF PAVIA)

Italian versions of *Two-Part Inventions* published up to 1985 are Instructive editions (IEs) made by pianist-revisers with practical and didactic purposes. These publications reflect a wider process of re-evaluation of Bach's Music in the Italian bourgeois and amateur context, though adapting it to the musical and

stylistic taste of the contemporaneous audience. My research aims to understand how the didactic and interpretative approach to Bach's keyboard compositions changed in Italy from the last decades of the Nineteenth-Century to 1985 by analysing editor's indications on performance and interpretation.

Questions: What type of relationships lies between different revisers? How did they influence each other creating a multitude of traditions in performance praxis? Can we refer to it as 'school'? Which analytical method can be used to reconstruct each reviser's interpretative *ideas* in Instructive editions? Why reconstruct the history of Bach's didactic and interpretation in Italy by conducting a systematic analysis of Two part Inventions?

Identifying a Copyist of Bach and Zelenka

ANDREW FRAMPTON (UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE)

A manuscript copy held in the Bodleian Library (GB-Ob, MS Tenbury 749) of a mass setting by J. S. Bach's contemporary in Dresden, Jan Dismas Zelenka (1679–1745), exhibits a number of similarities with the handwriting of Johann Friedrich Agricola (1720–1774). A detailed comparison of selected Bach sources in Agricola's hand with this manuscript reveals the identity of the scribe and uncovers striking new evidence about the manuscript's filiation history, providing fresh insight into the copying activities of one of Bach's most esteemed pupils.

Questions: Although Agricola is well known as a Bach copyist, little research has examined his manuscript copies of works by other composers and their relationship to his activities as a composer, teacher and *Kapellmeister* (a topic that I intend to pursue further as part of a doctoral study on Agricola). For what purpose(s), therefore, might Agricola have copied this mass (and similar works by other composers)? How do these findings enhance our understanding of the transmission and reception of church music by J. S. Bach and his contemporaries in the mid-eighteenth century?



Dialogue Session 4

CANTATAS IN CONTEXT

MODERATOR: STEPHEN ROSE

Bach's Thomaner – Disciples of their Teacher?

BERND KOSKA (BACH-ARCHIV LEIPZIG)

The students of the Thomasschule formed the choir used for Bach's cantata performances and were taught either 'publice' or 'privatim' by the Thomaskantor. Over the past three years a research project at the Leipzig Bach-Archiv has examined the biographies of the Thomaner. Of special interest have been the

activities of the Thomaner who went on to obtain cantor posts in various central German towns.

Questions: How can we assess Bach's influence on the Thomaner? To what extent did the music life in different protestant regions differ from that in the main cultural centre of Leipzig?

A University Student as Librettist – Important Impetus for Bach's Church Music in Leipzig

CHRISTINE BLANKEN (BACH-ARCHIV LEIPZIG)

The discovery of Christoph Birkmann's Nuremberg libretto cycle from 1728 – see *Understanding Bach*, 10 (2015), 9–30 – sheds new light on Bach's Thomaskantorat from 1725 to 1727. Birkmann's pietistic background and his distinctively modern style with its perfect sense of metaphor seems to have inspired Bach, who was in need of new cantata texts. The strongly subjective perspective of the librettos drove him to create a series of outstanding solo cantatas – his main compositional output from the autumn 1726 to 1727. The variety of instruments used in these cantatas gives the impression that he had quite a good ensemble, probably composed of university students.

In his autobiography Birkmann stated that he 'diligently followed the great composer Mr. Bach and his choir, and in winter joined in with the *collegia musica*'. This connection with Bach's *collegia musica* could prove to be a fruitful new research area especially regarding Birkmann's fellow university students whose names are found in Birkmann's *Stammbuch* (album).



Dialogue Session 5

COPYISTS, CANTATAS, CHORALES AND CENSORSHIP

MODERATOR: RICHARD D. P. JONES

Activities around the composer's desk: the roles of Bach and his copyists in parody production

TATIANA SHABALINA (ST PETERSBURG STATE CONSERVATORY)

The paper continues to research the problems raised in the paper 'Bach's Parody Process: Observations from the Early Leipzig Manuscripts' (16th Biennial Conference on Baroque Music, Salzburg 2014) and to trace further evidence in Bach's parody manuscripts from the mid 1720s till the 1730s, which sheds light on the role of copyists who assisted Bach in preparing cantatas in these extremely intensive years. A new study of the original manuscripts of Bach's parodies and revisions, together with the research into the peculiarities of the composer's work with his students and copyists will enrich our knowledge of their joint efforts throughout J. S. Bach's creative career.

Questions: This dialogue session asks whether in the 1720s and 30s Bach could trust to his most skilful copyists part of the parody procedures in his cantata production. According to existing sources the ability to make a parody was a skill required of poets and composers, and this raises the questions of whether the parody procedure was a part of Bach's teaching methods, or if it was a task trusted only to professional scribes? What degree of freedom would Bach's students and copyists have had in this task? Is it possible to reconstruct the stages of the parody process on the manuscripts made by Bach and his copyists?

Prince Albert and the Reception of the Chorale in England

PETER SMAILL (EDINBURGH)

The marriage of the royal cousins Victoria (House of Hanover) and Albert (of Saxe-Coburg-Gotha) on 10 February 1840 initiated a significant cultural transfer of German chorale harmonisations, including those of J. S. Bach, to the British Court; well in advance of Winkworth's famous *Chorale Book for England* (1863). Albert was instrumental in introducing the related musical settings for the first time to a wide and influential audience by his management of State and other occasions, as well as playing a role in the early performances of the St Matthew Passion BWV 244; after his death Victoria insisted on both Albert's and J. S. Bach's harmonisations being performed, as is reflected in her recently-digitised journal by over fifty references (between 1840 and 1896 and usually in German) to the *Chorale*.

Questions: Prince Albert's musical training at Gotha was augmented by contact with Mendelssohn, the German Ambassador and chorale enthusiast Baron Bunsen, and more remotely by William Sterndale Bennett. To what extent did each of these influences affect Albert's decision to introduce the chorale to a much wider audience?

Can we trace Albert's interest or use of material to Capellmeister Stöelzel (d. 1749), or Christian Friedrich Witt's *Psalmodia Sacra* of 1715, the chorale book of the Gotha court, or to other sources from Bach's time?

Creativity versus censorship in the Lutheran church cantata

STEPHEN ROSE (ROYAL HOLLOWAY)

Lutheran church musicians around 1700 were subject to two conflicting demands: on the one hand, the expectation that they adorn the liturgy with regular new compositions, and on the other hand the church authorities' suspicion of individual creativity. These conflicting demands were discussed by Johann Kuhnau in his legal dissertation of 1688 and by Martin Heinrich Fuhrmann in his writings of the 1710s and 1720s. In Halle there were attempts to censor the creativity of church musicians, by requiring musicians to submit their libretti or even their new compositions to clerical censors.

Questions: This dialogue session asks how far such debates may have shaped Bach's output of church cantatas. In particular, does the evidence of censorship in

Halle give credence to the anecdote that Bach had to submit his cantata libretti to Superintendent Deyling for approval?



Dialogue Session 6

MUSIC, MUSICIANS AND PATRONAGE IN SAXON DURING THE REIGN OF AUGUST THE STRONG

MODERATOR: BETTINA VARWIG (KING'S COLLEGE LONDON)

Music via Correspondence: A List of the Collection of Kreuzkirche Organist Emanuel Benisch

SAMANTHA OWENS (UNIVERSITY OF QUEENSLAND)

When John Sigismund Cousser made preparations to travel from Ireland to Continental Europe in April 1716, among the items he packed was a catalogue of all the church music in his possession. He no doubt intended this to be used when arranging the future musical exchange of individual pieces or even copied out in full by interested parties, just as Cousser himself had copied out a lengthy list of sacred music owned by Emanuel Benisch (senior), organist at the Dresden Kreuzkirche, 1696–1725.

Questions: This paper examines Cousser's inventory of the contents of Benisch's collection – which comprises a total of 169 items, the majority being Latin motets for voices and instruments – and asks where the Kreuzkirche organist might have obtained these works. Furthermore, given that this list survives in the commonplace book of a Dublin-based musician, what can it tell us about the ways in which music was circulated in early eighteenth-century Europe?

Organists of Leipzig's royal Catholic chapel 1719–1740 (and beyond)

JANICE B. STOCKIGT (UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE)

In 1719, when an organ was commissioned for Leipzig's royal Catholic chapel, the first of six young Bohemians arrived to fill the dual role of organist and sacristan. Records from the both the Jesuits who staffed the chapel and from the Dresden court reveal that after serving a musical apprenticeship in Leipzig, at least three of these players moved into royal musical establishments of Dresden. Thus, Leipzig's Catholic chapel became a conduit into Saxony for a series of talented young Bohemian musicians.

Questions: To what extent was the development of the Bohemian organists influenced by the flourishing musical life of Leipzig? In which ways were the Jesuits dependent upon musical services and advice available in Leipzig, and did co-operation exist between Lutheran and Catholic musicians living there?

In the shadow of the Hofkapelle: music and musicians in the circle of the Dresden nobility during the reign of August II and August III. Introduction

SYMON PACZKOWSKI (UNIVERSITY OF WARSAW)

In 1697–1763, a period coinciding with the reign of the electors of Saxony as Kings of Poland (August II, 1697–1733, and August III, 1733–1763), the Dresden Hofkapelle was one of Europe’s foremost court orchestras. The operations of the Hofkapelle were usually managed by top-ranking officials who were aristocrats involved in the state apparatus of the Polish-Saxon court. Many were also aspiring music patrons in their own right, overseeing a vigorous music life in their private residences. This paper is a sample of my research on the music patronage of leading political figures at the Polish-Saxon court in the first half of the 18th century. General Christoph von Wackerbarth and Marshall Jacob Heinrich von Flemming serve as examples.

Questions: In what ways were these two aristocrats involved in the official musical life of the Polish-Saxon court? What was the nature and purpose of their private music patronage? What was the scope and make-up of their private music ensembles? What were the areas of intersection between state and private patronage?



Dialogue Session 7

BACH’S MUSICAL TEXTS

MODERATOR: KATHARINE PARDEE (UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD)

The conflict of symmetrical form and text setting by J. S. Bach

GERGELY FAZEKAS (LISZT ACADEMY IN BUDAPEST)

The notion of symmetry—called ‘eurythmia’, or ‘Wohlgereimtheit’ in early 18th century German theoretical texts—played a special role in J. S. Bach’s musical thinking. Several examples may be cited of Bach’s preoccupation with the symmetrical disposition of musical events, either at the level of the overall form of a cyclical work (the early cantata BWV 106 or the Symbolum Nicenum section of the B-minor Mass, are just two examples from the chronological extremes of Bach’s oeuvre), or at the level of one musical movement, the most famous and spectacular example being the F major Duetto from Klavierübung III. From Ulrich Siegele to David Yearsley several scholars have analyzed the perfect symmetry of this movement, but what none of them mention is that there is (at least) one other example of this type of symmetry: the soprano-alto duet from cantata BWV 91. It seems that in this case musical symmetry was a more important compositional concern for Bach than the coherence of the text setting.

Questions: Why did Bach disregard proper text setting in the duet of BWV 91? How did Bach decide when text setting and musical form should collide with

each other? And on a more general level: How important a part did musical form play in Bach's compositional process?

Critical Edition or As You Like It

ZOLTÁN SZABÓ (UNIVERSITY OF SYDNEY)

Working on the edition history of the Bach Cello Suites for my PhD dissertation, it occurred to me that although about one in five of the more than one hundred editions of the Suites claim explicitly or implicitly to be 'critical', the exact definition of and expectations from a critical edition appear to be far from clear. In this paper, I would like to propose a set of more vigorous, workable criteria to which an edition should have to conform in order to justify the term Critical Edition.

Questions: Can you think of instances where the outlined conditions would need to be modified? Do you see a need for a generally accepted definition for terms, such as 'critical editions'? Do you agree that a more stringent definition of how critical editions should be prepared would produce better quality critical editions and would therefore ultimately contribute to a higher level of manuscript studies?



Dialogue Session 8

NEW ONLINE RESOURCES FOR BACH SCHOLARSHIP

YO TOMITA (QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY BELFAST)

CHRISTINE BLANKEN (BACH-ARCHIV LEIPZIG)

CHRISTIANE HAUSMANN (BACH-ARCHIV LEIPZIG)

In today's research environment we are fortunate to have instant access via the internet to all kinds of resources that a decade or so ago would have been difficult to access. This developmental trend is set to continue. In this session we will outline various online projects that are on-going, planned for the near future at the Bach-Archiv or under consideration for development.

Questions: What do we want to achieve with the gathering of new data? What sort of research environment do we desire? What kind of online resources do we want to be developed for future Bach research?



BNUK Roundup

PRESENTATION: RUTH TATLOW WITH TRUSTEES AND COUNCIL MEMBERS

Information, questions and discussion concerning the activities and vision of Bach Network UK.

Allegro

Andante